

University of Dundee

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

Individuals and society in transition a narrative study of parents' use of smacking

Redman, Susan

Award date:
2010

Awarding institution:
University of Dundee

[Link to publication](#)

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

Individuals and society in transition

a narrative study of parents' use of smacking

Susan Redman

2010

University of Dundee

Conditions for Use and Duplication

Copyright of this work belongs to the author unless otherwise identified in the body of the thesis. It is permitted to use and duplicate this work only for personal and non-commercial research, study or criticism/review. You must obtain prior written consent from the author for any other use. Any quotation from this thesis must be acknowledged using the normal academic conventions. It is not permitted to supply the whole or part of this thesis to any other person or to post the same on any website or other online location without the prior written consent of the author. Contact the Discovery team (discovery@dundee.ac.uk) with any queries about the use or acknowledgement of this work.

CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	1
DECLARATION	2
ABSTRACT	3
CHAPTER 1 PREFACE AND THESIS OVERVIEW	5
CHAPTER 2 LITERATURE REVIEW: PHYSICAL PUNISHMENT OF CHILDREN IN CONTEXT	
2:1 INTRODUCTION	19
2:2 PROBLEMATISING DEFINITIONS OF SMACKING	23
2:3 CONCEPTUALISING SMACKING FROM THE PERSPECTIVE OF PSYCHOLOGICAL RESEACH	26
2:3:1 Does Smacking Have any Long Term and Short Term Effects?	27
2:4 SOCIO-CULTURAL CONCEPTS OF SMACKING	41
2:4:1 Cultural Patterns of Physical Discipline	42
2:4:2 Media Representation of Smacking	49
2:5 CHILDREN'S RIGHTS	53
2:5:1 Different Understandings of Children's Rights	54
Who Owns the Child?	
Protectionist Perspectives on Children's Rights	
A Liberationist Perspective on children's Rights	
A Pragmatic Approach to Children's Rights	
Valuing Children Within Relationships of Reciprocity With Adults	
2:6 LISTENING TO CHILDREN'S VOICES ABOUT SMACKING	61
2:7 CHANGING PERSPECTIVES ABOUT CHILDHOOD AND CHILDREN	64

2:8	HOW HAVE HEALTH CARE PROFESSIONALS CONCEPTUALISED SMACKING ?	70
2:9	SUMMARY	81
CHAPTER 3	METHODOLOGY	86
3:1	INTRODUCTION	
3:2	TRUTH, REALITY AND KNOWLEDGE	87
3:2:1	Social Interactionism	90
3:2:2	Social Constructivism	91
3:2:3	Interpretivism	93
3:2:4	The Position of the Researcher as Writer and Interpreter	94
3:2:6	Defining Culture	103
3:3	STUDY DESIGN AND METHODS	104
3:4	PART ONE: MEDIA REPRESENTATION OF SMACKING	107
3:4:1	Part One: Data Collection	108
3:4:2	Analysis of Print Media Texts	110
3:5	PART TWO: BIOGRAPHICAL NARRATIVE INTERVIEWS	112
3:5:1	Selection and Recruitment of Participants	112
3:5:3	Regional Diversity	115
3:5:3	Socio-economic Diversity	116
3:5:4	Engaging With Fathers	119
3:5:5	Recruitment of Health Visitors	121
3:5:6	Issues of Environment	122
3:5:7	Ethical Issues	123
3:6	USING INTERVIEWS TO GENERATE DATA	124
3:6:1	Defining Narrative	125
3:6:2	Generating Narrative	128
3:6:3	Rationale For Episodic Interviewing	129
3:6:4	Strengths of Episodic Interviewing	131
3:6:5	Limitations of Episodic Interviewing	133
3:6:6	Data Management and Analysis of Interviews	134
3:6:7	Paradigmatic Analysis Across Narratives	139
3:6:8	Analysis Within Narratives	141
3:7	MEASURING GOODNESS IN NARRATIVE RESEARCH	142
3:7:1	Issues of Representation	144

3:7:2	Validity and Credibility	150
	INTRODUCTION TO THE INTERPRETIVE STAGE OF THE STUDY	153
CHAPTER 4	PART ONE: SMACKING AS REPRESENTED IN THE PRINT MEDIA	154
4:1	INTRODUCTION	154
4:2	PRINT MEDIA REPORTAGE ON SMACKING	155
4:3	DEFINITIONS OF SMACKING IN THE PRINT MEDIA	159
4:4	THEMES FOUND WITHIN THE PRINT MEDIA SMACKING DISCOURSE	160
4:4:1	The Rights of the Child: Children are People	160
4:4:2	The Effectiveness of Smacking: A Short Sharp Smack	164
4:4:3	Yob Culture: The Long-Term Effects of Lack of Parental Discipline	167
4:4:4	Hunting, Shooting and Smacking: The Role of the State	171
4:5	SUMMARY	175
	PART TWO: NARRATIVE INTERVIEWS WITH PARENTS, GRANDPARENTS AND HEALTH VISITORS	178
CHAPTER 5	PRODUCTION AND PERFORMANCE OF A LIFE STORY	180
5:1	INTRODUCTION	180
5:2	SETTING THE NARRATIVE IN CONTEXT	180
5:2:1	Demography	185
5:2:2	Religion and Family Life	186
5:2:3	Economic Activity	188
5:2:4	Social Capital, Cultural Conservatism and Identity	189
5:2:5	Health Visiting Practice	190
5:3	EPISODIC INTERVIEWING IN PRACTICE	193
5:3:1	The Temporal Ordering Of Narratives	194
5:4	DEFINITIONS OF SMACKING	196
5:4:1	Smacking is Violence	198
5:4:2	Smacking is Legitimate Parenting Behaviour	203

5:4:3	Embodied Definitions of Smacking	204
5:4:4	Definitions of Smacking and Children's Ages	206
5:5	GOOD SMACKS AND WEE TAPS	216
5:6	SUMMARY	224
CHAPTER 6	THEMATIC CONTENT OF NARRATIVES	229
6:1	INTRODUCTION	229
6:2	TRANSITION	230
6:3	DEVELOPMENTAL TRANSITION: BEING A CHILD	233
6:3:1	The Idyllic Childhood	234
6:3:2	Conflict in Childhood	239
6:4	BEING A PARENT: EVOLUTION, TRIGGERS, TURNING POINTS AND PRESERVATION	250
6:4:1	Triggers	252
6:4:2	Turning Points	257
6:4:3	Evolution	261
6:4:4	Preservation	262
6:5	BEING IN SOCIETY IN TRANSITION	266
6:6	SUMMARY	269
CHAPTER 7	NARRATIVE EXEMPLARS: LIVES IN TRANSITION	271
7:1	INTRODUCTION	271
7:1:1	Chaos	272
7:1:2	Quest	274
7:1:3	Restitution	275
7:2	CHAOS NARRATIVES	277
7:2:1	Exemplar One: Carol's Narrative: State Intervention: The 'Not Smack'	277
7:2:2	Exemplar Two: Tracy's Narrative: State Intervention: Turning a Life Around	285
7:3	QUEST NARRATIVES	290
7:3:1	Exemplar Three: Hannah's Narrative: Finding the Tools	291
7:3:2	Exemplar Four: Laura's Narrative: The Ripple Effect	296
7:4	RESTITUTION NARRATIVES	301
7:4:1	Exemplar Five: Janice's Narrative: Banning the Bomb and Burning the Belt	301

7:4:2	Exemplar Six: Joni's Narrative: Ending the Cycle of Bad Mothers	305
7:5	SUMMARY	309
CHAPTER 8	BIG STRUCTURES, LARGE PROCESSES AND SMALL STORIES	316
8:1	INTRODUCTION	316
8:2	PRINT MEDIA NARRATIVE, COLLECTIVE MEMORY AND BIOGRAPHY	319
8:2:1	Responding to a changing Media Template	319
8:2:2	Wee Smacks and Taps Revisited	320
8:2:3	Generation and Memory	321
8:2:4	The Unsayable, Contradictions And Aporias In Narrative Accounts: Responses to a Changing Discourse	323
8:3	FROM DEFINITION TO TRANSITION AND TRANSFORMATION	332
8:3:1	Recognition, Reciprocity and Responsibility	334
8:4	SUMMARY	336
CHAPTER 9	CONCLUSIONS, RECOMMENDATIONS AND IMPLICATIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH AND PRACTICE	338
9:1	INTRODUCTION	338
9:2	CHAPTER OVERVIEW	338
9:3	IMPLICATIONS FOR CLINICAL PRACTICE AFTERWORD	351
9:4	RECOMMENDATIONS FOR PRACTICE	353
9:5	RECOMMENDATIONS FOR POLICY	355
9:6	RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH AFTERWORD	356 357
	REFERENCES	358

APPENDICES

1	Taylor J. and Redman S. (2004) The Smacking Controversy: What Advice Should We Be Giving Parents?	378
2	Redman S. and Taylor J. (2006) Legitimate Family Violence as Represented in the Print Media	386
3	Participant Information Leaflet: Health Visitors	395
4	Participant Information Leaflet: Parents and Grandparents	397
5	Consent Form	399
6	Confirmation of NHS ethical approval of the study	400
7	Transcript of an entire narrative	401
8	Grid 1: Definitions of smacking	415

TABLES

Table One	Timeline: Physical Punishment in the UK	10
Table Two	Data abstraction framework used to interrogate the print media texts	111
Table Three	Number of Articles found in the Selected Newspapers	155
Table Four	Reportage on Various themes Presented in Five UK Newspapers in Four Different Years	156
Table Five	Catalogue of Euphemisms and Phrases for Corporal Punishment	217
Table Six	Timeline: History, Media Voices and Generation	328

FIGURES

1	“At La Gare St. Lazare” Cartièr-Bresson / Magnum Photos (1932)	128
----------	---	------------