DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

Individuals and society in transition
a narrative study of parents’ use of smacking

Redman, Susan

Award date:
2010

Awarding institution:
University of Dundee

Link to publication
Individuals and society in transition

*a narrative study of parents’ use of smacking*

Susan Redman

2010

University of Dundee
# CONTENTS

**ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

1

**DECLARATION**

2

**ABSTRACT**

3

## CHAPTER 1  PREFACE AND THESIS OVERVIEW

5

## CHAPTER 2  LITERATURE REVIEW: PHYSICAL PUNISHMENT OF CHILDREN IN CONTEXT

2:1 INTRODUCTION 19

2:2 PROBLEMATISING DEFINITIONS OF SMACKING 23

2:3 CONCEPTUALISING SMACKING FROM THE PERSPECTIVE OF PSYCHOLOGICAL RESEARCH 26

2:3:1 Does Smacking Have any Long Term and Short Term Effects? 27

2:4 SOCIO-CULTURAL CONCEPTS OF SMACKING 41

2:4:1 Cultural Patterns of Physical Discipline 42

2:4:2 Media Representation of Smacking 49

2:5 CHILDREN’S RIGHTS 53

2:5:1 Different Understandings of Children’s Rights 54

Who Owns the Child?
Protectionist Perspectives on Children’s Rights
A Liberationist Perspective on Children’s Rights
A Pragmatic Approach to Children’s Rights
Valuing Children Within Relationships of Reciprocity With Adults

2:6 LISTENING TO CHILDREN’S VOICES ABOUT SMACKING 61

2:7 CHANGING PERSPECTIVES ABOUT CHILDHOOD AND CHILDREN 64
## METHODOLOGY

### 3:1 INTRODUCTION

### 3:2 TRUTH, REALITY AND KNOWLEDGE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subsection</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Social Interactionism</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Constructivism</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interpretivism</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Position of the Researcher as Writer and Interpreter</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 3:2:6 Defining Culture | 103 |

### 3:3 STUDY DESIGN AND METHODS | 104 |

### 3:4 PART ONE: MEDIA REPRESENTATION OF SMACKING | 107 |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subsubsection</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Part One: Data Collection</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis of Print Media Texts</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 3:5 PART TWO: BIOGRAPHICAL NARRATIVE INTERVIEWS | 112 |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subsubsection</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Selection and Recruitment of Participants</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regional Diversity</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Socio-economic Diversity</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engaging With Fathers</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recruitment of Health Visitors</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Issues of Environment</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethical Issues</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 3:6 USING INTERVIEWS TO GENERATE DATA | 124 |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subsubsection</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Defining Narrative</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Generating Narrative</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rationale For Episodic Interviewing</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strengths of Episodic Interviewing</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limitations of Episodic Interviewing</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data Management and Analysis of Interviews</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paradigmatic Analysis Across Narratives</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis Within Narratives</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 3:7 MEASURING GOODNESS IN NARRATIVE RESEARCH | 142 |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subsubsection</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Issues of Representation</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INTRODUCTION TO THE INTERPRETIVE STAGE OF THE STUDY

CHAPTER 4
PART ONE: SMACKING AS REPRESENTED IN THE PRINT MEDIA

4:1 INTRODUCTION
4:2 PRINT MEDIA REPORTAGE ON SMACKING
4:3 DEFINITIONS OF SMACKING IN THE PRINT MEDIA
4:4 THEMES FOUND WITHIN THE PRINT MEDIA
4:4:1 The Rights of the Child: Children are People
4:4:2 The Effectiveness of Smacking: A Short Sharp Smack
4:4:3 Yob Culture: The Long-Term Effects of Lack of Parental Discipline
4:4:4 Hunting, Shooting and Smacking: The Role of the State
4:5 SUMMARY

PART TWO: NARRATIVE INTERVIEWS WITH PARENTS, GRANDPARENTS AND HEALTH VISITORS

CHAPTER 5
PRODUCTION AND PERFORMANCE OF A LIFE STORY

5:1 INTRODUCTION
5:2 SETTING THE NARRATIVE IN CONTEXT
5:2:1 Demography
5:2:2 Religion and Family Life
5:2:3 Economic Activity
5:2:4 Social Capital, Cultural Conservatism and Identity
5:2:5 Health Visiting Practice
5:3 EPISODIC INTERVIEWING IN PRACTICE
5:3:1 The Temporal Ordering Of Narratives
5:4 DEFINITIONS OF SMACKING
5:4:1 Smacking is Violence
5:4:2 Smacking is Legitimate Parenting Behaviour
APPENDICES

3. Participant Information Leaflet: Health Visitors 395
4. Participant Information Leaflet: Parents and Grandparents 397
5. Consent Form 399
6. Confirmation of NHS ethical approval of the study 400
7. Transcript of an entire narrative 401
8. Grid 1: Definitions of smacking 415

TABLES

Table One  Timeline: Physical Punishment in the UK 10
Table Two  Data abstraction framework used to interrogate the print media texts 111
Table Three  Number of Articles found in the Selected Newspapers 155
Table Four  Reportage on Various themes Presented in Five UK Newspapers in Four Different Years 156
Table Five  Catalogue of Euphemisms and Phrases for Corporal Punishment 217
Table Six  Timeline: History, Media Voices and Generation 328

FIGURES

1. “At La Gare St. Lazare” Cartièr-Bresson / Magnum Photos (1932) 128